

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexiones
obser
vaciones



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

DECOLONISING EDUCATION: CRITICAL REFLECTIONS FROM INDIA

LA DESCOLONIZACIÓN DE LA EDUCACIÓN: REFLEXIONES CRÍTICAS DESDE LA INDIA

Mukherjee, Mousumi¹

¹O.P. Jindal Global University, Sonipat, Haryana, India, mmukherjee@jgu.edu.in
<http://orcid.org/0000-0001-9251-9165>

ABSTRACT

Educational development within the postcolonial Indian Nation-state is integrally connected with the colonial history. Much like other postcolonial nations, modernisation of Indian society through education is a product of the “local history” and the “global design” of colonialism and contemporary processes of globalisation. The modern colonial imaginary has been predominant in shaping the “subject lessons” learnt by modern Indian elites. Though there were missionaries, some benevolent Europeans, and native intellectuals committed to the cause of education for the uplift of the Indian masses, the British Raj mostly promoted the education for the elites. This modern colonial imaginary also shaped Indian nationalism and the nationalist freedom movement led by the elites of the Indian society. Within a diverse class, caste, multi-ethnic and religious context, often this nationalist imaginary led to the suppression of subaltern voices. The establishment of the Modern Indian nation-

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexiones
obscurecidas
no nacidas



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

state with a democratic constitution drafted by a constituent assembly with representation from all sections of the diverse Indian society (including 15 women from diverse backgrounds) and chaired by Dr. B. R. Ambedkar, a dalit¹ scholar and intellectual, promised the establishment of democracy and social justice. However, this paper argues that the constitutional promise cannot be fulfilled without decolonising the aims and objectives of education that serves the interest of specific elite groups. In order to decolonise education, it would be of utmost importance to align the aims and objectives of education with that of democratic education.

KEYWORDS: decolonisation, education, democracy, social justice, India

RESUMEN

El desarrollo de la educación en el estado-nación de la India postcolonial se vincula íntegramente con la historia colonial. De manera muy similar a otras naciones postcoloniales, la modernización de la sociedad india mediante la educación es un producto de la “historia local” y del “diseño global” del colonialismo y de los procesos contemporáneos de globalización. El imaginario colonial moderno ha sido predominante a la hora de moldear los “temas de las lecciones” aprendidos por las élites indias modernas. Aunque hubo misioneros, algunos europeos benevolentes, e intelectuales nativos comprometidos con la causa de la educación para elevar las masas indias, el Raj británico promovió fundamentalmente la educación para las élites. Este imaginario colonial moderno moldeó igualmente el nacionalismo indio y el movimiento nacionalista de libertad liderado por las élites de la sociedad india. En un contexto de castas, multiétnico y religioso diverso, a menudo este imaginario nacionalista desembocó en la supresión de las voces subalternas. El

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexiones
obser
vaciones
no



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

establecimiento del moderno estado-nación indio con una constitución democrática redactada por una asamblea constituyente con representación de todos los sectores de la diversa sociedad india (incluyendo 15 mujeres provenientes de diferentes contextos) y presidida por el Dr. B. R. Ambedkar, un académico e intelectual ‘dalit’², prometió el establecimiento de la democracia y la justicia social. Sin embargo, el presente trabajo sostiene que la promesa constitucional no puede ser cumplida sin la descolonización de las aspiraciones y objetivos de la educación que sirve a los intereses de grupos de élite concretos. Para descolonizar la educación, sería fundamental alinear sus pretensiones y objetivos con los de la educación democrática.

Palabras clave: *descolonización, educación, democracia, justicia social, India*

1. INTRODUCTION

Speaking in the Constituent Assembly on 4 November 1948, Dr. B. R. Ambedkar, the chair of the Constituent Assembly that drafted the modern Indian constitution, said:

Constitutional morality is not a natural sentiment. It has to be cultivated. We must realise that our people have yet to learn it. Democracy in India is only a top-dressing on an Indian soil which is essentially undemocratic [B. R. Ambedkar] (Roy, 2014).

Recalling the above quote from Ambedkar about the undemocratic Indian society, Arundhati Roy in her 2014 essay highlights the implementation challenges of the democratic Indian constitution. This is because more than half a century and a decade after the Indian constitution came into force on 26th January 1950, Indian

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexiones
obscurecidas
no nacidas



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

introduction of modern western education led to the rise of Nationalist leaders and freedom fighters. On the other hand, many native Indians became too busy rote-learning western knowledge in English for purely material instrumental gains within the colonial Indian context. The critical social consciousness raising aims and objective of modern western education was lost for these Indians. These Indians continued with their traditional social practices in their private lives. This problem was often identified as a “moral crisis” and it has been discussed at length based on extensive historic evidence by Sanjay Seth (2007). Nobel Laureate Indian national poet, Rabindranath Tagore, also critiqued this phenomenon of rote-learning unfamiliar content in school textbooks in a foreign language as early as in 1892 in his essay শিক্ষার হেরফের (*Shiksar Herfer*) meaning Topsy-turvy Education.

Like all his writings, *Shiksar Herfer* was initially written and delivered as a speech in Bengali by Tagore. In this essay Tagore reflected critically on his own early educational experiences in both formal Bengali and English medium schools in Calcutta compared to English education in England. According to Tagore, while both the language and the content of education in England was integrally connected to English life and society, it was completely disconnected from the life of Bengali children during colonial India. This encouraged rote-memorising rules of grammar and sentence structure more than critical thinking and understanding. Tagore believed learning should be a joyous experience of mental and physical freedom for the child and learning should be connected to the child’s social and cultural environment.

In his own experimental school in Shantiniketan, he sought to establish an alternative system of early education in mother tongue, alongside developing a multilingual curriculum and well-trained teachers to stimulate critical thinking and

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexiones
obser
vaciones



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

creative imagination. Another native intellectual of colonial Calcutta, Iswarchandra Vidyasagar, was seeking to do similar things by modernising curricular content in the spoken language, Bengali, and devising pedagogic approaches to stimulate critical thinking and questioning through the mode of native storytelling, as it has been also argued by Spivak (2002). This is very similar to the arguments Darder (2022) makes in her article about culturally democratic pedagogy:

A culturally democratic pedagogy also creates the conditions for subaltern students to develop the courage to question the structures of domination that control their lives. In this way, they awaken their subaltern voice as they participate in moments of reflection, critique, and action together with other students who are also experiencing the same process of discovery. Hence, students are not only provided with curricular content that is considered culturally relevant or language instruction in their native tongues. Rather, they are actively involved in critically examining curricular content, texts, and classroom experiences to determine the emancipatory as well as oppressive and contradictory values that inform their thoughts, attitudes, and behaviors. Through this critical pedagogical process, subaltern students develop their abilities to understand their lives as cultural and political beings, as well as how to understand themselves as subjects of history and cultural citizens of the world (Darder, 2022).

However, the colonial logic and influence was so powerful that the pedagogic experiments of “organic intellectuals”, such as Tagore or Vidyasagar remained in the periphery. Since English slowly became the language of trade and commerce, and coveted colonial government jobs, most students and their parents longed for modern western education imparted in English. This trend continues even today in

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

no i n v e s t i g a c i o n e s
n o i n c l u d e
o i b i t e r r o s
r e f e r e n c i a s
e x p e r i e n c i a s



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

the postcolonial era and has intensified in the recent years following neoliberal globalisation.

As Ashish Nandy (1983) has argued, the dilemma of the post-colonial condition is that

colonialism colonizes minds in addition to bodies and it releases forces within colonized societies to alter their cultural priorities once and for all. In the process, it helps generalize the concept of the modern West from a geographical and temporal entity to a psychological category. The West is now everywhere, within the West and outside, in structures and in minds (Nandy, 1983, p. xi).

Similarly, I argue here that in the age of globalisation the “East is now everywhere, within the East and outside, in structure and minds”.

Hence, caste-based discrimination has now become a global social problem, as it persists even among the highly educated Indian diaspora abroad living in places, such as the Silicon Valley in the United States. This has justified Ambedkar’s (1916) prophecy (published in 1917), as he once wrote in a paper while he was a student at Columbia University:

The caste problem is a vast one, both theoretically and practically. Practically, it is as institution that portends tremendous consequences. It is a local problem, but one capable of much wider mischief, for “as long as caste in India does exist, Hindus will hardly intermarry or have any social intercourse with outsiders; and if Hindus migrate to other regions on earth, Indian caste would become a world problem” (Ambedkar, 1917, paragraph 4).

Indeed, caste has become a world problem in the twenty-first century. Caste has become integrally linked with postcolonial national identity formation (Singh, 2015).

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexiones
obser
vaciones



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

In the following section of this article, I will analyse the role that schooling played in the postcolonial National Identity formation.

3. SCHOOLING & POSTCOLONIAL NATIONAL IDENTITY

Schooling plays a major role in social reproduction around the world. In postcolonial India, schooling played a major role in Indian national identity formation. Over the past 75 years through the standardised National Curriculum Frameworks (NCF) and various ritual practices, such as National flag hoisting during Independence Day, and Republic Day, and singing of National anthem daily, Indian schools have sought to forge a strong National identity amongst the citizens. This has been done by mostly disregarding the exploitative and oppressive structures that are still prevalent among the idealised postcolonial Indian society (Kamat, 2004). As India became independent from oppressive colonial rule, the power shifted from the colonisers to the local ruling elites. Mukherjee and Singh (2021) write:

after the colonial masters left, the power dynamics were hijacked by caste and class divides within the indigenous Indian society. This is against the vision of the founding fathers of postcolonial Indian national imaginary, like Tagore and Gandhi, who viewed education as vehicles of transformative social change and nation-building through inclusive education. The ethos of Tagore's *Shantiniketan*, Gandhi's *Nai Taleem*, and the ideas of Nehru, Ambedkar, and Maulana Azad were centred around the concept that education would help alleviate the status of the people who were relegated to the fringes of the society due to cast and class divides (Batra, 2005). There is an urgent need for the future NCF to remove these systematic barriers for the

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexiones
obscurecidas
no incluidas



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

traditions, then we need to question what decolonisation would entail. Rather than looking at indigenous societies through orientalist lens, we need to take a critical perspective of these societies and need to consider the critiques of the oppressed classes and social evils. As Darder (2022) rightly emphasised by quoting from Gramsci at the beginning of her article: “But democracy, by definition, cannot mean merely that an unskilled worker can become skilled. It must mean that every “citizen” can “govern”, and that society places him [or her] in a general condition to achieve this” (Antonio Gramsci, 1971).

For the citizens to learn to “govern” themselves and establish a democratic system of governance “of the people, by the people and for the people” democratic education in schools and democratising educational institutions should be of utmost importance. Hence, I argue in this article that decolonising education in the postcolonial Indian context needs to take the form of democratic education in schools.

The aims and objectives of education should be geared towards the establishment of a democratic society by mentoring citizens for democratic governance. Once educational aims and objectives will be geared towards democracy, then curriculum, pedagogy and modes of assessment will also change to become more democratic in their orientation. Rather than upholding any identity or ideology as superior, curricular content will become more inclusive of diversity. Pedagogy will become more reflexive and critical. Modes of assessment will be designed to evaluate learning outcomes, rather than being designed for elimination of some students, who fail to perform well in exams. In the following section of this paper, I will discuss at length one such exemplary decolonial model of schooling and education established by the first Asian Nobel Laureate and postcolonial India’s National poet, Rabindranath Tagore.

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexión
intercambio
investigación



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

Image 1. Open air classes at Shantiniketan. Source: <https://www.telegraphindia.com/opinion/inner-vision/cid/1847871>



Unlike in the traditional classrooms, children were allowed to climb the trees and run around in between classes. They were allowed to observe nature, play, and learn amidst natural surroundings to create a sense of bonding with the elements of nature. Students were also encouraged to ask questions to their teachers about various aspects of the natural surroundings based on their observations. This kind of scientific enquiry-based pedagogy was encouraged in his decolonial model of school, rather than rote-learning from textbooks in a foreign language. Inclusivity and ecological awareness were most important aspects of Tagore's decolonial model of school.

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
reflexión
iniciación
noivccuude



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

for the sustainability of planet Earth. This is our only hope for survival as humanity. Else, we will soon become extinct like the dinosaurs in this age of Anthropocene.

7. NOTES

¹ “Dalits” (oppressed) are the “outcastes” and historically marginalised communities within India. The caste system within the Indian subcontinent is a centuries old practice of sociological distinction by birth based on familial occupation. Those who fall outside the caste system are referred to as “outcastes”. Since the British introduced the system of collected caste-based demographic data, they are referred to as scheduled castes / scheduled tribes (SC/ST) and other backward castes (OBC) in official documents.

² Los ‘dalits’ (oprimidos) son las comunidades excluidas de las castas e históricamente marginadas en la India. El sistema de castas del subcontinente indio es una práctica, de cientos de años de antigüedad, de distinción sociológica por nacimiento basada en la ocupación familiar. Los que quedan fuera del sistema de castas son denominados “excluidos de las castas”. Desde que los británicos introdujeron el sistema de recopilación de datos demográficos basándose en castas, se alude a los excluidos de las castas como castas marginadas / tribus marginadas y otras castas postergadas en documentos oficiales.

³ Caste is an Indian marker of social distinction based on profession. There were 4 main castes into which ancient Indian Hindu society was divided – Brahmins (priests or scholars), Kshatriyas (warriors), Vaysvas (businessmen & traders), and Shudras (workers in service). Anybody outside of these 4 main castes were referred to as “outcastes”. The “outcastes” would do menial works as manual scavenging, garbage removal and cleaning etc. They have been historically marginalized, oppressed and discriminated against since ancient times. Hence, they are popularly referred to as “dalits” (oppressed). Even though there has been much fluidity in modern times, still caste-based discrimination is rampant even among modern Indian society. This also includes those belonging to other South Asian religions and the diasporic population. Please see: <https://theconversation.com/caste-doesnt-just-exist-in-india-or-in-hinduism-it-is-pervasive-across-many-religions-in-south-asia-and-the-diaspora-180470>.

⁴ “Saffronising the curriculum” or “saffronisation of education” within the postcolonial Indian context is connected to the rise of Hindu Nationalism or “Hindutva”, a right-wing political ideology that seeks to establish a Hindu nation. See: <https://theologyandsociety.com/where-does-hindutva-really-come-from/>

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

no nacude
i i n v e s t i g a c i o n e s
o b i e t t o s
r e f e r e n c i a s
e x p e r i e n c i a s



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

Mukherjee, M. (2021). Tagore's perspective on decolonising education. In G. W. Noblit (Ed.), *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Education*. Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190264093.013.1559>

Mukherjee, M. & Singh, A. (2021). Postcolonial national identity formation through social studies: The case of India. In K. J. Kennedy (Ed.), *Social Studies Education in South and South East Asian Contexts* (pp. 17-27). New York, NY & London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003057598-4>

Nandy, A. (1983). *The Intimate Enemy: Loss and Recovery of Self Under Colonialism*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Nussbaum, M. (2012). *Not for Profit. Why Democracy Needs the Humanities*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Puri, B. (2022). *The Ambedkar-Gandhi Debate: On Identity, Community and Justice*. Singapore: Springer. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-8686-3>

Rao, P. V. (2009). Gandhi, untouchability and the postcolonial predicament: A note. *Social Scientist*, 37(1/2), 64-70. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/27644310>

Rao, P. V. (2014) (Ed.). *New Perspectives in the History of Indian Education*. New Delhi: Orient Blackswan.

Rao, P. V. (2019). Myth and reality in the history of Indian education. *Espacio, Tiempo y Educación*, 6(2), 217-234.

AULA DE ENCUENTRO

experiencias
referenciales
obscurecidas
no invencibles



Mukherjee, M. (2022). Decolonising education: Critical reflections from India. *Aula de Encuentro*, volumen extraordinario (1), Reflexiones pp. 215-237

Roy, A. (2014). The Doctor and the Saint: Ambedkar, Gandhi and the battle against caste. *The Caravan*. Retrieved from:

<https://caravanmagazine.in/reportage/doctor-and-saint>.

Seth, S. (2007). *Subject Lessons: The Western Education of Colonial India*. Durham, NC & London: Duke University Press.

<https://doi.org/10.1215/9780822390602>

Singh, S. (2015). Caste and diaspora. *International Journal of Social Science and Humanity*, 5(1), 80-82. <https://doi.org/10.7763/IJSSH.2015.V5.426>

Smith, D. (2005). *Institutional Ethnography: A Sociology for People*. Lanham, New York, Toronto & Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Spivak, G. (2002). Ethics and Politics in Tagore, Coetzee, and certain scenes of teaching. *Diacritics*, 32(3/4), 17-31. <https://doi.org/10.1353/dia.2005.0001>

Stroud, S. R. (2017). What did Bhimrao Ambedkar learn from John Dewey's *Democracy and Education*? *The Pluralist*, 12(2), 78-103.

<https://doi.org/10.5406/pluralist.12.2.0078>.

Tagore, R. (1892). Sikshar Herfer. In *Sikshya* [a collection of essays on education] (pp. 17-19). Shantiniketan: Visva-Bharati, 1990. English translation: *Towards Universal Man*. Bombay & London: Asia Publishing House, 1961.

Tagore, R. (1906). The problem of education. In R. Tagore (Ed.), *Towards Universal Man*, 1961 (pp. 67-82). Bombay & London: Asia Publishing House.