

‘They Are from Good Families Like Ours’

Educated Middle-Class Identities and (Im) Mobility among Young Dalit Women

Sugandha Nagpal

Educated Dalit Women

Over a cup of sweet milky tea, I chat with 23-year-old Kavita about her experience of living in Chaheru, a predominantly Dalit¹ village in the Doaba region of Punjab. Compared to other regions of Punjab, Doaba has the highest rates of outmigration as well as other forms of Dalit mobility, including greater strides in education, employment and social mobility. With Kavita I discuss clothing, movies and food, as well as her plans and hopes for the future. Kavita belongs to the Ad-dharmi or Chamar² community and has completed her MA in History from the nearby Ramgharia college. She harbours ambitions to move away from the village space through international migration and has obtained educational qualifications as a beautician and caregiver with this objective in mind. While she waits to migrate, Kavita also applies for teaching jobs in the vicinity of the village and says that in the event that migration does not work out, she wants to pursue her PhD. She belongs to a migrant middle-class family, of which many members reside abroad: Kanta, Kavita’s mother, has three older daughters who are all married. Kavita’s oldest sister is in the UK, and the second oldest moved to Italy to join her husband towards the end of my fieldwork. She has another older sister, Meeta, who lives in Chandigarh with her husband. Kavita’s younger brother, Suresh, was training to be a chef so that upon migration to Canada he could work in his uncle’s restaurant. Her older brother, Ramesh, is separated from his wife and works at a factory in Bangalore.

Towards the end of my fieldwork, Kavita recounts that a few months earlier, she received an offer to work in a bank in Chandigarh. But she was not allowed

to work there because her maternal grandmother, who lives in Canada, said that she wants her to either come to Canada through the *nanny visa*,³ work and be independent, or get married. She refused to sponsor or support Kavita's PhD studies in India. On another day, Kavita tells me that her sister who lives in Italy is pressurizing her to get married. She also points out that Ramesh will not allow her to work too far from the village. Kavita's plans and aspirations for her future are in flux and constantly evolving in response to the interventions of her relatives and gendered and class-based expectations around marriage and respectable employment.

Like Kavita, the other young women from upwardly mobile families I interacted with were either in the process of pursuing higher education or had completed their undergraduate and postgraduate education and were similarly navigating the requirements of female respectability and urban modernity. After completing their education, these young women aimed to migrate through marriage, which is seen as the most respectable way for women to migrate. They also sought 'respectable jobs', such as teaching, which are not too far from their home and do not have long working hours, allowing them to fulfil their domestic responsibilities or government jobs which were associated with stability, higher income and status. In practice, however, very few women were able to migrate as a result of marriage migration or secure government employment, their difficulties in attaining these mobility outcomes reflecting continuities in historical disadvantages. This chapter explores the ways in which young women like Kavita, a minority within their community,⁴ use college education to construct middle-class identities, which are tied to the idea of mobility or the physical and cultural movement away from the village space, even though in many respects they may remain immobilized in the physical sense by structural and cultural gender norms within their communities.

Judge and Bal (2009), in their work on social change in rural and urban Dalit communities in Jalandhar and Amritsar (Punjab), note that despite generational advances in education, educational attainments have not been significant enough to propel occupational changes. In the absence of these outcomes, most young women ended up tutoring or doing stitching work from home. However, a question that emerges is, why do women continue to pursue education, even in the absence of mobility outcomes? Previous anthropological work on education and development has indicated that even in the absence of tangible outcomes, education allows young men and women to gain status in their communities (Jeffrey et al. 2008; Ciotti 2010). In drawing on this literature, the chapter explores the value of education, when it does

not necessarily lead to mobility outcomes in a context with a strong culture of migration.

Much of the existing work on migration and education focuses on the ways in which migrant remittances are directed towards the education of children back home and the issue of brain drain (Yang 2004; Thieme and Wyss 2005; Rao 2010). Some work points out how education choices become defined by the desire to migrate and subsequent migration trajectories (Ali 2007; Corbett 2007). In this chapter, I draw on the construct of middle classness to explore young women's everyday discourses and interactions around mobility as the mental and cultural movement away from the village space. The chapter is based on an eleven-month ethnographic study, which involved residing in and spending extended periods of time in young women's homes. I assert that while education is an important pathway to migration in Chaheru, in the absence of migration opportunities education also serves as an important way for women to carve out modern middle-class identities while remaining in the village space. The extent to which they are able to use education as a pathway to physical mobility, however, is shaped by their family's social and economic positioning.

Education, Development and Migration

In the context of development, education has often been conceived through its link with tangible outcomes such as employment, increase in women's age at marriage and the ability to impact social change (Dreze and Sen 1995; Chopra and Jeffery 2005). Especially for Dalits, education has been seen as a crucial aspect of social mobility, allowing them to attain achieved status and overcome their ascribed status or identities (Ciotti 2006; Judge and Bal 2009). Explorations of the links between education and migration have not extensively and qualitatively engaged with the question of how young people, especially from marginalized communities, engage with education as a site of mobility, in a context where there is a strong culture of migration.

The existing work with different populations suggests that in migration cultures educational choices become defined by the desire to migrate (Ali 2007; Corbett 2007). Ali (2007), for example, finds that in Hyderabad the educational choices of young men and women to pursue computer programming or medical sciences are guided by opportunities for migration in the United States. In turn, educational facilities and options in Hyderabad also adapt to increasing migration to Gulf countries. For instance, there has been a proliferation of

private schools in Hyderabad and many of them have adopted Arabic as the primary medium of instruction. In his seminal work with coastal communities in Nova Scotia, Corbett (2007) argues that there is a 'migration imperative' in rural education, drawing people away from home communities, cultures, livelihoods and familiar environments. He identifies education and migration as two strong disciplinary forces in the modernization of rural people. Among rural young men, he equates resistance to education with the unwillingness to migrate and fulfil the conditions of manhood set by the community. These works point to the close links between education and migration, wherein education serves as a precursor to migration trajectories. However, what happens when there is a long or uncertain gap between the pursuit of education and the act of migration? Rao (2010) points out the importance of attending to the 'social processes through which migration and education interact to shape people's lives, identities and status in society' (137). In the context of Chaheru, young women's educational aspirations are not confined to the act of migration but also entail aspirations for social mobility, status and processes of self-making. Thus, exploring the links between education, migration and development in Chaheru entails attending to young women's everyday meanings and associations of education and mobility

Education and Middle Classness

Previous anthropological work has pointed out that while it is often difficult to tie education with tangible mobility outcomes, nonetheless, education allows young men and women to gain status in their communities (Jeffrey et al. 2008; Ciotti 2010; Franco 2010). For instance, Ciotti (2010), based on her work with Manupur Chamars in Uttar Pradesh, India, asserts that even though a majority of the young Chamar women are unable to pursue a college degree and do not find employment outside their homes, they do not think of their education as being useless. Education allows them to acquire knowledge, a cultural capital that will stay with them throughout their lives, to attain economic self-sufficiency and to distance themselves from the 'lower class other' and engage in middle-class formation (239–42).

In her work with college-going girls and their families in Bangladesh Franco (2010) finds that, among better-off households, daughters' education is an enhancer of status and allows for marriage to be postponed until higher secondary certificate or a university degree is obtained. For the college-going girls, unlike their parents, education was not tied to marriage but its ability

to open up opportunities for employment and economic independence. The young girls had aspirations to become teachers, college professors or nurses and expressed their self-esteem and self-worth through declarations of their plans to find a job after completion of their education (156). However, much like the case of Chaheru, a large majority of these girls were unable to secure employment. Despite the mismatch between aspirations and outcomes, Franco (2010) asserts that young women are able to effectively use education to develop 'awareness of their wishes and needs and increase their capacity to negotiate different ways of being part of the society' (62). These studies demonstrate that even in the absence of tangible outcomes, education can serve as a useful tool for self-making and establishing affinity to high-status cultures. The present chapter situates itself in this literature and probes the self-making of two differently positioned young women in Chaheru.

Migration and Mobility Imaginaries

Chaheru is a predominantly Ad-dharmi village located at a distance of 5 kilometres from Phagwara city. The village's location in the Doaba region of Punjab⁵ and its proximity to a city imply that ideas of urbanity and especially migration circulate and acquire prominence in the village space. The village has a strong culture of international migration going back to the 1970s, when the first labour migrants left for Gulf countries. Villagers see the migration to the Gulf and Western countries as having brought *sudhar*, or development, to the village. Community members often use the discourse of migration to highlight the ways in which they have charted autonomous paths of mobility that were not reliant on government support.⁶ Contemporary migration trends from Chaheru include continued migration to the Gulf and to other traditional migrant destinations like the United States, the United Kingdom, Canada and Australia along with migration to a large number of countries in southern and eastern Europe (Kapuria and Birwal 2017). Due to its lower costs, young men in Chaheru often construct migration to the Gulf as a back-up option and instead set their sights on migrating to Western countries to compete with the affluence and status of the upper castes.

Among upwardly mobile families in Chaheru there are two dominant mobility imaginaries. Given the strong migration culture in Chaheru, international migration emerges as the main pathway for moving away. Compared to employment and further education, it also signals a more permanent move away

from the village. Young women from upwardly mobile families seek migration as it allows them access not only to wealth but also to urban Western lifestyles and culture. In the absence of migration, however, young women, especially from more secure middle-class families, attempt to establish proximity to the local urban space by seeking opportunities for employment and further education. These opportunities are associated with ideas of urban modernity, urban leisure, open interaction with members of the opposite sex, greater levels of awareness and cultural sophistication. Young women's imaginaries of mobility rely on specific constructions of the local urban space, the West and the village. These imaginaries of mobility are referenced and used by young women to carve middle-class identities in the village space.

The Middle Class in Chaheru

In Chaheru, the production of middle-class status emerges as the enterprise of young women, between the ages of eighteen and thirty-five from upwardly mobile families. Their orientation towards education and local employment sets them apart from the young men in the community who are more invested in accumulation of wealth through migration. In their negotiations with education, young women engage with status production work (Papanek 1979; Osella and Osella 2000; Chopra 2011) and create a respectable middle-class identity. In this context, the middle-class ethos is defined as one that facilitates movement outside the village, enhances status and is distinctive from the backward lower classes. Middle-class culture in Chaheru is inextricably linked to discourses of caste, class and gender that allow young women to physically and culturally distinguish themselves from the [*lower class*] 'vernacular' young women, who are bound by rural traditions and norms (Ciotti 2010: 218). Previous work on middle-class culture speaks to this very project of fashioning an in-between identity (Liechty 2003).

In defining the framework for middle-class identity in Chaheru, occupation and proximity to migration are important indicators of a family's ability to consume, its access to educational facilities and its type of household structure. The middle class in Chaheru is a diverse group composed of migrant families (with family members in the Gulf or Europe⁷), professionally employed families in government jobs and well-to-do business families. These families are referred to as migrant, educated and self-employed families, respectively. These groups vary not only in their choice of occupation but also in the

ways that they negotiate the middle-class requirements of consumption and distinction.

All middle-class families pursue the education of young women to the extent that it is affordable. In fact, as soon as an upwardly mobile family is able to accrue some wealth, they invest in the education of their daughters. However, for migrant families, the education of women in itself is not a source of distinction. Rather, the building of large urban houses, hosting grand weddings and investments in property are the markers of status. In contrast, educated families see the education of their children as a crucial metric of distinction. They also invoke the construct of *jankari*, or awareness, and exposure to urban cultures with regard to education, fashion and food. It allows them to establish proximity to the cultured and urban middle class. Self-employed families can be seen as occupying an in-between cultural space. Similar to the migrant families, they value explicit markers of wealth like large houses and celebrations of social events like weddings. However, they also facilitate the higher education of their children at prestigious institutes, even though in most self-employed families the parents are illiterate.

Another factor that differentiates middle-class families is the security with which families can claim middle-class status. While almost all upwardly mobile families in Chaheru were engaged in the process of acquiring the ability to emulate 'appropriate' class practices, their level of cultural competence was dependent on economic resources, with less secure families lacking the means to reliably perform middle-class consumption. Through the experiences of Somika and Kavita, I explore how young women from less secure migrant and more secure educated middle-class families respectively occupy middle-class positioning.

Looking Down

Somika is twenty-four years old and belongs to an educated and secure middle-class family. She is the daughter of Balveer, a government bank clerk and a well-respected member of the community. The house that she resides in Chaheru belongs to her maternal grandmother. The family moved to Chaheru when Somika was in school to take care of her ailing grandmother. The environment in Somika's house is relatively open and egalitarian. In other households, young women often have a formal relationship with their fathers and are careful to conduct themselves in a demure way. In contrast, Somika talks freely in the

presence of her father and even feels comfortable enough to interject when her father is talking with me.

Somika has completed her MA from a college in Jalandhar, a nearby city located 23 kilometres from Phagwara, and is preparing to take competitive exams for government posts. She also tutors children in the evenings. Somika often expresses frustration at the low levels of education in the village, and many of our discussions centre on the lack of female education. Like many educated young women in the village who are 'waiting' for opportunities for high-status employment to materialize, she often complains about the lack of mobility in her career trajectory and expresses that it is difficult to sit at home for so long and not do anything. During my field work period she prepares and sits for the Life Insurance Corporation of India and government bank exams. Somika says she has taken these exams multiple times before. She also plans to prepare and sit for the railway exams.

Unlike other young women who face greater restrictions around their mobility, Somika has the support from her parents to pursue opportunities that may require her to travel further distances from the village. Towards the end of my fieldwork, Somika began classes for competitive government exams at the Ambedkar institute in Phagwara. When representatives from the institute came to talk to people in the village about the coaching that they offer, they held a meeting at Somika's house. Somika laments that while many girls showed up to find out about the classes, no one is coming to the classes because they think it is too far (the classes are being held in Phagwara town). She says,

the girls here don't know there is special coaching for competitive exams like the bank exam . . . even the other girl that went with me [*from a poorer family in the village*] didn't know . . . even I have been raised here and have the same education yet I knew these things . . . if you have to do something you have to do it regardless of how hot it is [*in reference to Kavita's reason for not going because it is too hot*] . . . I have a banking exam for the position of a clerk . . . I've been trying for the last 5-6 years but I am confident I will get it.

In this excerpt, Somika presents herself as a girl who, despite growing up in the village, is well informed, confident and determined. She distinguishes herself from other young women in the village, who are characterized as restricted, unaware and unmotivated. Interestingly, Somika locates the other young women 'here' within the village space, while specifying that even though she has grown up in the village she does not imbibe other young women's concerns and restrictions. This desire to mark oneself as distinct from the village, both

culturally and physically, underlies the narrative of young women, especially from secure middle-class families.

Middle-class families often describe the village space as one beset with backwardness, immorality, violence and drugs and seek to distance themselves from it. For instance, Somika's parents' concern about social interactions in the village translates to Somika's brothers only spending time with the sons of one other family. By way of explanation, Somika says, 'they are from a good family like ours.' The category of 'good families' is reserved for similarly placed secure middle-class families and the insinuation of pollution and immorality is linked to lower-class villagers. This illustrates the efforts of secure middle-class families to carve a middle-class identity that is dissociated from the stigma attached to lower castes. In fact, Somika herself only socializes with her neighbours and says she does not have any friends in the village, unlike young women from less secure families in the village who reported having friends that they have grown up with and meet occasionally.

Being Middle Class

In order to unravel Somika's middle-class identity and contrast it with Kavita's, it is important to place their narratives about education in the context of their family's social and economic positioning. In contrast to migrant or self-employed families, secure educated families had better links with the urban space. Many of Somika's relatives, for example, lived in Jalandhar, and she regularly visited them and explored urban leisure sites such as movie theatres and malls. Moreover, Somika's father's employment in a government bank translated to a secure pathway to middle-class consumption. In contrast, Kavita belongs to a less secure migrant middle-class family with limited and unreliable access to economic resources. Her younger brother Suresh was unemployed and waiting to migrate at the time of my field work. While Kavita and her mother claimed that her older brother Ramesh worked in Bangalore, the gossip in the village was that he was in jail for drug-related crimes. This family's insecure economic and moral positioning translated into weaker links to urban modernity.

Somika's family used their access and exposure to urban modernity as social capital and demonstrated openness to urban Western fashions and food habits.⁸ In contrast, while Kavita's mother Kanta lacked the economic resources of more secure migrant families, she displays a preference for claiming proximity to Western migrant lifestyles in her grooming and upkeep of the house. Kanta's

house was one of the only houses in the village among those that I visited to have toilet paper and mosquito repellent, which, she explained, was a consequence of frequent interactions with migrant relatives.

However, in contrast to other educated young women in the community who attempt to showcase their exposure to urban culture in their clothing, demeanour and movement within the village, Kavita appeared detached from projections of urban modernity. Unlike other young women from middle-class families who typically limit their movement within the village and look forward to planning trips to the city, engaging in urban leisure activities and adorning more urban clothes, Kavita was more comfortable walking around the village and her visits outside were limited to when her sisters were visiting and needed to go shopping. Similarly, in her everyday behaviour Kavita reflects rural styles of talking, gesticulating and working. The only time she slips into an urban style is when she goes shopping to the local market with her sisters or with me. On these occasions, she dresses in a pair of jeans and a top. Somika, on the other hand, would often don jeans and a sleeveless top even while at her home in the village. These behaviours serve to position Kavita differently within the community, and often other educated young women living there express surprise over Kavita's educational qualifications and do not evaluate her as having the same social positioning as them.

Moreover, Kavita's and Somika's conversations around education and mobility also revealed different concerns. While Somika used her educatedness to mark her distinction from lower-class women in the village, Kavita pointed to the difficulties she encountered in negotiating access to education and employment opportunities. Kavita's ability to pursue opportunities for employment, education and migration were closely determined by her migrant relatives. In explaining the power that they exercised Kavita said, 'You don't get it, over here people who live abroad and who have more money make the decisions in the family . . . in our house, the Italy sister makes the decisions.' As recounted at the beginning of the chapter, Kavita often discussed her inability to take up certain opportunities due to the control exercised by her migrant relatives. In addition, she also had to manage the concerns raised and presented by her non-migrant family members. For instance, Kavita expressed her inability to take the Chandigarh job, not only because of the decision of her migrant relatives but also because of her responsibility to Kanta. She says, 'I cannot do that job because I cannot leave her (referring to her mother) like that . . . she needs help with house work.' Kavita's mother has polio and Kavita divided the daily household chores with her. When I asked her what would happen if she went to Canada, Kavita tells me her older

brother, Ramesh, would get remarried and *bhabhi* (her brother's wife) would come and do the work. Kavita also frequently referred to 'getting permission' from Ramesh to pursue any employment opportunity that involved travelling to another city. Thus, unlike Somika who had better access to opportunities and greater permissibility to travel longer distances for education and employment, Kavita's conversations pertained to the obstacles she had to encounter. She often expressed a sense of helplessness saying, *hum peeche reh gaye* ('we have been left behind'). This statement captures the sense of immobility and stuckness Kavita feels as she navigates and accommodates to the preferences of her family.

Thus, while both Somika and Kavita drew upon their educatedness to claim a middle-class positioning in Chaheru, they occupy this middle classness very differently. While Kavita referenced movement to spaces outside the village, her everyday discourses pertained to negotiating access to education and further employment rather than using her educational status to carve a distinctive identity. In contrast, Somika and similarly placed women were more engaged in using education as a site of distinction. Specifically, by emphasizing the importance of young women's ability to travel independently and pursue opportunities for education and employment, Somika was able to claim proximity to an urbanized or modern idea of female mobility. In her work with Manupur Chamars, Ciotti (2010) also asserts that upwardly mobile Chamar women are attempting to appropriate the 'modern' that is linked to the city space, while distancing themselves from the village (220). Given that several young women from educated and secure middle-class families in Chaheru had close links with urban spaces, appropriating ideas of urban modernity appears like a natural extension of their aspirations for mobility. However, even young women from these families were confined by ideas of 'appropriateness' and familial responsibilities. For example, towards the end of my fieldwork Somika began working at a private company in Jalandhar. But when there was a death in her family, she left her job to be able to attend to all the visitors who were coming over to her house to express their condolences. Thus, despite claims of female mobility, it is implicit that this mobility is conditional on being able to fulfil one's responsibilities at home. This harkens back to Radhakrishnan's (2008) idea of the modern woman who straddles both work and home.

Education and Mobility?

The differential interactions of Somika and Kavita with education have one point of commonality; in both cases, education at least in the short term has

not translated to the desired mobility outcomes. Following my fieldwork, I learned that Kavita had secured employment at a local private school, while Somika continued to work towards passing the government employment exams. In most cases, even when young women are able to attain undergraduate and postgraduate education, it does not coincide with commensurate occupational opportunities opening up for them. This speaks to continuities in historical disadvantages. Dalit women are often unable to access elite educational institutes due to their insecure economic status. Consequently, they are unable to develop English fluency, competence in urban and Western mannerisms, and strong social networks of well-placed Dalits (Heyer 2014; Still 2015). In addition to compromised educational access, gendered norms around physical mobility make it difficult for young women to travel to different cities for educational and employment opportunities. Most young women seek opportunities for education and employment in proximity to the village and within Phagwara, as they are often disallowed by parents from moving to another city. Somika's pursuit of her degree in Jalandhar is an anomaly rather than the norm.

Thus, young women's plans and choices around education do not appear as individualized assertions of autonomy but are instead nestled in family plans and concerns around mobility and status. In fact, even the extent to which young women are able to perform educatedness is shaped by their family's economic and social positioning. This echoes previous work on young women and education in India, which pinpoints the importance of family considerations around status, class and female respectability in shaping young women's interactions with education (Chopra 2011; Froerer 2012; Osella and Osella 2000; Still 2011; Vijayakumar 2013).

In returning to the question posed in the introduction, despite the obstacles to attaining government employment or marriage migration, education continues to be valued by young women and even their parents. For parents, the importance of education is located in its instrumental value for marriage migration and accruing middle-class status. For young women, while education is an important part of working towards the goals of employment and migration, it is also seen as an important tool for developing cultural knowledge and status. As Franco (2010) points out, young women's plans and aspirations around education are significant because they reveal that 'the girls are saying that they can imagine their lives and themselves not only as mothers and wives, whose interests and needs are embedded in those of their families, but also as active participants in wider networks of social relations' (157). While Kavita, limited by the economic resources at her disposal, makes less strong claims to

educational mobility, the discourse presented by Somika operates as an ideal that is referenced and selectively emulated by differently located young women in Chaheru. Thus, in expanding our focus to incorporate the non-tangible aspects of educational mobility, it is possible to see young women as invested in a more complex process of social change and identity formation. Despite its inability to guarantee mobility outcomes, education allows some young women in Chaheru to access urban spaces, develop familiarity with urban cultural mores, emulate aspects of the urban middle class and position themselves as the cultured middle class.

Notes

- 1 The caste system is a defining feature of social and labour relations in rural India. While there are fewer upper-caste groups, the majority of caste groups fall within the lower-caste realm, which can be further differentiated into scheduled castes (SC) or Dalits and other backward castes (OBC or BC). Scheduled tribes (ST) or Adivasis refer to India's aboriginal population that falls outside the caste system but are often couched together with scheduled castes in policy and government speak under the banner of SC and ST. These two groups are benefactors of affirmative action and government programmes due to their historically marginalized status (Chakravarti 2003).
- 2 In this study the Chamars in Chaheru are referred to as Ad-dharmis or Dalits based on respondents' self-identification. The hereditary occupation of Chamars consists of the snaring of skins and hides, tanning and leatherwork. Among Punjab's Dalit communities, Ad-dharmis are the most numerous and fare better on education, employment and other indicators of development. The economic mobility of Punjabi Ad-dharmis is complemented by their religious and social assertions (Jodhka 2002; Judge and Bal 2009; Ram 2009; Singh et al. 2012).
- 3 This was the term used by Kavita to refer to the caregiver visa.
- 4 The historical and contemporary work on Dalit education in Punjab has shown that education, as a site of social mobility, is available to a minority of better-placed Dalits (Judge and Bal 2009; Pimpley 1976).
- 5 A celebratory narrative of migration is pervasive in Punjabi popular culture, state discourse and everyday parlance in Punjabi villages and towns. This strong culture of migration dates back to Punjab's economic decline, which began in the 1980s. In the early 1980s as agricultural productivity and incomes began dwindling, agrarian protest coincided with the political unrest and persecution that followed Operation Bluestar. This coincidence of economic and political turmoil conspired to create social uncertainty and led to the exodus of young men from Punjab. Doaba is the

- region of Punjab with the highest number of outmigrants (Chopra 2011; Gill 2005; Gill 2009; Singh et al. 2007).
- 6 Kumar (2004) points out that in Dalit communities, migration is even more valued because it is seen to be crucial in allowing lower castes to attain economic mobility and override caste stigma.
 - 7 Those families that had migrated to North America no longer lived in the village and only came to visit.
 - 8 Educated and secure middle-class families tend to incorporate dishes from different regions of India in their home food, and this is an important part of demonstrating their exposure to urban culture.

References

- Ali, S. (2007). "Go West Young Man": The Culture of Migration among Muslims in Hyderabad, India', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 33(1), 37–58. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830601043489>.
- Chakravarti, U. (2003). *Gendering Caste: Through a Feminist Lens*. Calcutta: Sage.
- Chopra, R. (2011). *Militant and Migrant: The Politics and Social History of Punjab*. New Delhi: Routledge.
- Chopra, R., & Jeffery, P. (Eds) (2005). *Educational Regimes in Contemporary India*. New Delhi: Sage Publications.
- Ciotti, M. (2006). 'In the Past We Were a Bit "Chamar"': Education as a Self- and Community Engineering Process in Northern India', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 12(4), 899–916. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9655.2006.00369.x>.
- Ciotti, M. (2010). *Retro-Modern India: Forging the Low-Caste Self*. London: Routledge.
- Corbett, M. (2007). *Learning to Leave: The Irony of Schooling in a Coastal Community*. Canada: Fernwood Publishing Co., Ltd.
- Dreze, J., & A. Sen. (1995). *India: Economic Development and Social Opportunity*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Franco, D. N. (2010). 'Aspirations and Self-Hood: Exploring the Meaning of Higher Secondary Education for Girl College Students in Rural Bangladesh', *Compare*, 40(2), 142–65. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057920903546005>.
- Froerer, P. (2012). 'Learning, Livelihoods, and Social Mobility: Valuing Girls' Education in Central India', *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 43(4), 344–57. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23359073>.
- Gill, A. (2009). 'Punjab Peasantry: A Question of Life and Debt', *Journal of Punjab Studies*, 16(1), 71–88.
- Gill, S.S. (2005). 'Economic Distress and Suicides in Rural Punjab', *Journal of Punjab Studies*, 12(2), 219–37.

- Heyer, J. (2014). ‘Dalit Women Becoming “Housewives”’: Lessons from the Tiruppur Region 1981/2 to 2008/9’, in C. Still (Ed.), *Dalits in Neoliberal India: Mobility or Marginalization?* Abingdon: Routledge, 208–35.
- Jeffrey, C., Jeffery, R., & Jeffery, P. (2008). *Degrees without Freedom : Education, Masculinities and Unemployment in North India*. New Delhi: Orient Blackswan Pvt. Ltd.
- Jodhka, S. S. (2002). ‘Caste and Untouchability in Rural Punjab’, *Economic and Political Weekly*, 37(19), 1813–23. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4412102>.
- Judge, P., & Bal, G. (2009). *Mapping Dalits: Contemporary Reality and Future Prospects in Punjab*. Jaipur, India: Rawat Publications.
- Kapuria, S., & Birwal, D. (2017). ‘International Migration from Punjab: Trends and Challenges’, *Researchpaedia*, 4(1), 27–36.
- Kumar, V. (2004). ‘Understanding Dalit Diaspora’, *Economic and Political Weekly*, 39(1), 114–16. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4414473>.
- Liechty, M. (2003). *Suitably Modern: Making Middle Class Culture in a New Consumer Society*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press.
- OSELLA, F., & OSELLA, C. (2000). *Social Mobility In Kerala: Modernity and Identity in Conflict*. London: Pluto Press.
- Papanek, H. (1979). ‘Family Status Production: The “Work” and “Non-Work” of Women’, *Signs*, 4(4), 775–81. <https://doi.org/10.1086/493663>.
- Pimpley, P.N. (1976). ‘Social Characteristics of the Scheduled Caste Students in the Punjab’, *Indian Journal of Social Work*, 37(1), 49–54.
- Radhakrishnan, S. (2008). ‘Examining the “Global” Indian Middle Class: Gender and Culture in the Silicon Valley/Bangalore Circuit’, *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 29(1), 7–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07256860701759915>.
- Ram, R. (2009). ‘Ravidass, Dera, Sachkhand Ballan and the Question of Dalit Identity in Punjab’, *Journal of Punjab Studies*, 16(1), 1–34.
- Rao, N. (2010). ‘Migration, Education and Socio-Economic Mobility’, *Compare*, 40(2), 137–45.
- Singh, G., Simon, C., & Tatla, D.S. (2012). *New Forms of Religious Transnationalism and Development Initiatives: A Case Study of Dera Sant Sarwan Dass, Ballan, Punjab, India*. CORE. <https://core.ac.uk/display/2793894>. (accessed 18 October 2021).
- Singh, L., Singh, I., & Ghuman, S.R. (2007). ‘Changing Character of Rural Economy and Migrant Labour in Punjab’, *Migrant Labor*, 57–69. <https://punjab.global.ucsb.edu/sites/default/files/sitefiles/journals/volume16/no1/3-LakhwinderGill16%201%20%282%29.pdf>.
- Still, C. (2011). ‘Spoiled Brides and the Fear of Education: Honour and Social Mobility among Dalits in South India’, *Modern Asian Studies*, 45(5), 1119–46. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/25835714>.
- Still, C. (Ed.). (2015). *Dalits in Neoliberal India: Mobility or Marginalization?* New Delhi: Routledge.

- Thieme, S., & Wyss, S. (2005). 'Migration Patterns and Remittance Transfer in Nepal: A Case Study of Sainik Basti in Western Nepal'. *International Migration*, 43(5), 59–98. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2435.2005.00342.x>.
- Vijayakumar, G. (2013). "I'll be Like Water": Gender, Class, and Flexible Aspirations at the Edge of India's Knowledge Economy', *Gender & Society*, 27(6), 777–98. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243213499445>.
- Yang, D. (2004). *International Migration, Human Capital, and Entrepreneurship: Evidence from Philippine Migrants' Exchange Rate Shocks*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press. https://eml.berkeley.edu/~webfac/emiguel/e271_s04/yang.pdf (accessed 18 October 2021).